

Unit 6

God Works in the Church

The Days of Suffering and Promise

21. The Church Suffers

In the eleventh century tensions between the Greeks and Latins grew. In 1054 the Patriarch of Constantinople and the legate of the Pope of Rome excommunicated each other. In 1204 Europeans on the Fourth Crusade sacked Constantinople. The Eastern Churches were further weakened by the invasions of the Mongols and Ottomans.

22. The Church in a New Age

The fall of Constantinople ushered in a new world: western Europe entered a renaissance with the help of Byzantine artists and thinkers; the West entered the Age of Discovery, exploring the New World of the Americas; the Protestant Reformation gave the West a new impetus to clarify and express its faith. Eastern Christians coming under Western influence entered into union with Rome, becoming the Eastern Catholic Churches.

23. The Church in a New World

Europe entered an age of revolution, which brought about the end of its old empires and the idea of a "state religion." The Industrial Revolution prompted mass immigration, particularly to the United States and the establishment of Eastern Churches in the West. The rise of atheistic Communism and Nazi power challenged the Church as never before, producing a host of New Martyrs in the East.

AD 1000-1500	AD 1500-1750	AD 1750 - Now
Days of Suffering	Days of Division	Days of Promise
Crusades, Fall of Constantinople	Protestants and Eastern Catholics	Surviving Emigration and Persecution

Lesson 21 - The Church Suffers

Objectives

By the end of this lesson the student should know that:

- Know that the Churches of Rome and Constantinople separated from one another in the second millennium.
- Understand that relationships between the Eastern and Western Churches deteriorated because of the Crusades.
- Know that the Roman Empire ended with the Turkish conquest in the fifteenth century.
- Know that the territories of Rus' were controlled by Mongols and Tatars until the end of the fifteenth century.

For the Catechist

The Greek and Latin Churches separated from one another for a number of reasons. Some of them - competition over territory and liturgical differences - no longer affect us. Other issues remain: the text of the Nicene Creed and the question of papal authority. Clouding both issues was an ignorance of history. In 1054 the papal legate accused the Greeks of omitting the *Filioque* ("and the Son") from the Creed. The opposite was true: the Greeks had not omitted it; the Latins had added it. In 1204 the French and German bishops in the Crusader army decided that they certainly ought to attack the Greeks since they "formerly had been obedient to the law of Rome and now they were disobedient." They assumed that Constantinople was a daughter Church of Rome, like all the Churches of the West. The opposite was true: Constantinople was a sister Church that had never been dependent on the Patriarch of the West.

To this day people reveal a similar lack of awareness of the Church's history. A visitor to a Byzantine Catholic parish in 2005 (!) was troubled by the version of the Creed he heard. It "omitted" not only the *Filioque* but also that Christ "died." It was news to him that this word was not even in the Latin Creed; it was a twentieth-century American addition. As people "in the middle," Eastern Catholics need to know that we cannot ignore our history on the grounds that it does not affect us today. Our challenge is to make our presentation of the past begin to capture the interest of tomorrow's Eastern Catholics.

Materials Needed:

Opening Prayer: Icon corner, student texts

Introduction: Easel or wall pads, markers,

Guided Reading: Handout A

Activity A: TV, VCR, or DVD player and Crusades or Fall of Byzantium program

Activity B: Kingdom Tree Worksheet

Icons and Pictures:

See Gaetano Passarelli, *The Mother of God* (God With Us Publications) for a more in-depth treatment of the Vladimir icon.

1. Opening Prayer

Pray the hymn on page 105 in the student text. Remind the students that the "God-bearing Fathers" mentioned in the hymn are Saints Cyril and Methodius who began the Byzantine missions to the Slavic peoples.

2. Review

Review the main points of the previous lesson using the pages from your wall or easel pad. Use the time line on the Unit Page to recall that the seventh and eighth centuries saw the rise of Islam and the Arab capture of the patriarchates of Alexandria, Antioch and Jerusalem. Note that the ninth and tenth centuries saw the Byzantine mission to the Slavs and the baptism of Ukraine.

3. Introduction

Begin by asking for a moment of silence and conveying a serious, even somber mood. Say that today you are going to learn about one of the worst periods in history for Eastern Christians: "*When we studied the Roman persecutions we saw people tortured and killed by unbelievers for being Christians. Today we will see how Christians turned against one another and divided the Greek and Latin Churches.*"

Explain that among Jesus' last words before He was arrested is this prayer to the Father for the unity of Christians: "*I pray not only for them [the apostles], but also for those who will believe in me through their word, so that they may all be one, as you, Father, are in me and I am in you; that they also may be in us, that the world may believe that you sent me. And me I have given them the glory you gave me, so that they may be one, as we are one, I in them and you in me, that they may be brought to perfection as one, that the world may know that you sent me, and that you loved them even as you loved me*" (John 17:20-23). Jesus knew that people would not follow Him if His people were not united, as happened in the events of today's lessons. Let's see what happened.

Background Reading (Rome and Constantinople):

"In the eleventh century the Byzantine Church and the Roman Church also separated from communion with one another. Here the main dispute was probably over ecclesiology, the concept of the Church. The Churches of Rome and Constantinople had begun to experience difficulties after the capital of the Empire was moved to Byzantium. The Byzantine Church then began to feel that it had a special position as the Church of the chief city of the Empire. Rome countered that its primacy was due, not to the prominence of the city of Rome, but to divine institution through the Apostles Peter and Paul.

"In fact, the city of Rome was declining in importance, even in Europe. 'Demoted' to a secondary place, it ceased to have the kind of care and protection one would expect of a capital. Milan and later Ravenna became the centers of imperial rule in the West. In the fifth century the Lombards conquered part of Italy and sacked the city of Rome. This divorce from imperial rule led the popes to assume political authority in Rome. The pope was now not only the bishop of Rome but also its prince"

(TEE 39 continued on next page)

4. Guided Reading, Page 107

21

The Church Suffers



The Byzantine mission to the Slavs brought new peoples into the Christian family. The Church took root in Bulgaria, Croatia, Serbia and other areas on the Empire's northern borders. The work there also exposed a growing rivalry between the Greek and Latin Churches. Eastern and Western Christians became increasingly critical of each other's practices and began to doubt each other's faith as well.

Western Catholics in some countries had added a phrase to the Nicene Creed on their own, even though the Creed had been written by an Ecumenical Council.

While the Creed said that the Holy Spirit "proceeds from the Father," some Westerners said that the Spirit "proceeds from the Father and the Son (filioque in Latin)." Many believed that this phrase changed the very meaning of the Creed. They felt that it changed the Church's teaching about the Trinity.

This mission came to a head in the eleventh century. In 1054 Pope Leo IX had sent his secretary to Constantinople to discuss this and other problems with the emperor and the patriarch. Unsuccessful in his mission, the cardinal denounced the Greek Church for "omitting" this phrase from the Creed. He excommunicated the patriarch and left the city. The patriarch excommunicated him and the Churches of Rome and Constantinople severed relations with one another.

The Patriarch of Antioch tried to settle the differences between Rome and Constantinople, but he did not succeed. Events that followed widened the split and each Church went its separate way. It was only in 1965 that the excommunications of 1054 would be lifted by a twentieth century pope and patriarch, Paul VI and Athanasios I. Their Churches are still trying to solve the differences between them.

God With Us, Grade 6 Unit 6: God Works in The Church 107

Before the reading, **summarize the objectives of the lesson** on a wall pad or easel pad so that the page can be preserved and used for review next week.

Ask the students if they have ever tried to communicate with someone who didn't understand their language. How would they explain an idea or even a story to a person who only spoke Tlingit or Swahili. Would it be easy to agree on anything complex if people don't share a common language? One of the reasons the Greeks and Latins disagreed over the Creed was *language*: modern languages (e.g. French, German) were developing and the Latins no longer understood Greek.

Add that another reason for disagreement was that *documents were not available* as they are today. Printing had not yet been invented and people had to copy books and records by hand. Any kind of written material was rare and the Western Churches did not have correct copies of the writings of the Fathers or the texts of the Ecumenical Councils.

Stress that besides these reasons there was competition and mistrust between the Eastern and Western powers. They became like family members who are always fighting with one another.

Background Reading (Rome and Constantinople - continued):

"Although nominally still a part of the Roman (i.e. Byzantine) Empire, the West was left to go its own way. There were many local rulers, but none achieved any wider status until Charlemagne, the eighth century ruler of the Franks. He extended his rule through much of western Europe and in the year 800 was crowned Roman Emperor by the pope. Charlemagne's administration was carried out in great part by leading Frankish clergy who had little understanding of non-Frankish Christianity or sympathy for its structures. What had been understood as the single Christian empire was now divided. This would set the stage for the formal division of the Churches as well.

"At the end of the fifth century, there had been a temporary division (482-519) between Rome and Constantinople over imperial efforts to compromise with the non-Chalcedonian Churches. In the ninth century there was an even more serious division during the reign of the Patriarch Photius of Constantinople. One of the main issues then was which Church would have jurisdiction over the Church of Bulgaria. Over the centuries, many other disputes arose, often over jurisdiction. Since the sixth century, the Byzantine Church had come to regard Rome - which had increasingly assumed temporal power in Italy - as meddlers in their affairs"

(TEE 39-40 - continued on next page).

Note that in 1965 the pope and patriarch said this about what had happened in the eleventh century: "*They regret the offensive words, the reproaches without foundation, and the reprehensible gestures which, on both sides, have marked or accompanied the sad events of this period. They likewise regret and remove both from memory and from the midst of the Church the sentences of excommunication which followed these events, the memory of which has influenced actions up to our day and has hindered closer relations...*" ("Catholic-Orthodox Joint Declaration of 1965").

They were trying to be more faithful to Christ's prayer that Christians be united.

5. The Crusades Page 108



Ask the students why they think it took over 900 years for leaders of the Greek and Latin Churches to apologize for the events of the eleventh century.

Note that a big part of the reason was the Crusades. Ask the students whether they have heard the term and what they know about the Crusades. Refer the students to the map on page 176 ("The Growth of Christianity"): Note that the Muslims had come from Arabia (off the lower right corner of the map). By the eleventh century Muslims had conquered the area from Nicaea, a few miles from Constantinople around North Africa up to and including Spain. Ask what the students think the Europeans thought would happen next? (*The Muslims would attack them*). Instead the West began the Crusades, to recapture the Holy Land from the Muslims.

Direct the students to **read the first four paragraphs** of the text and identify the first example of Christians acting against Christians mentioned. (*Replacing Melkite bishops in the Middle East with Latins*) This was one of

Background Reading (Rome and Constantinople continued):

The split itself is usually dated to 1054, when the Patriarch Michael Cerularius of Constantinople and Cardinal Humbert, the papal legate, exchanged excommunications. At the time it was probably not regarded of any more significance than the earlier disputes. That this schism endured was more a result of the Crusades in the thirteenth century. Supposedly gathered to drive the Muslim Arabs from the Holy Land, the Crusaders under the direction of the doge of Venice occupied Constantinople instead. They sacked the city, drove emperor and patriarch into exile and replaced them with Latins, all with the pope's blessing. The mutual resentment resulted in a division between the two Churches which has endured to this day"

(*TEE 40 - continued on next page*).

the things that widened the division between the Churches.

Continue with the fifth and sixth paragraphs and ask the students to identify the next event that divided Eastern and Western Christians (*The Crusader destruction of Constantinople*), **Read the following excerpt** from a historian of the time, Nicetas Choniates: "*How shall I begin to tell of the things done by these despicable men. The icons, which they should have venerated, they trampled underfoot. The relics of the holy martyrs were thrown into the streets. Even the divine Body and Blood of Christ was spilled on the ground. ...the sacred altar [of the Great Church of Hagia Sophia], made of all kinds of precious material and admired by the whole world, was broken into bits and distributed among the soldiers... mules and horses were led to the very sanctuary to carry away the sacred vessels ... and other ornaments...*" Note that he was describing the acts of Christians against Christians.

Ask the students what effect they think the Fourth Crusade had on relations between the Greek and Latin Churches. **Read the sixth and seventh paragraphs** to see the result.

Background Reading (Rome and Constantinople continued):

"Theological questions also fuelled the estrangement of the Greek and Latin Churches, but almost as afterthoughts. The first of these issues to become prominent would dominate relations between Greeks and Latins for centuries to come. At the time of the ninth century schism German missionaries in Bulgaria had quarreled with the Greeks over use of the expression 'and the Son' (*Filioque*) in the Nicene Creed. The original text, citing John 15:26, speaks of, 'The Holy Spirit, the Lord and Giver of life, who proceeds from the Father, who with the Father and the Son is worshipped and glorified.' The Frankish Emperor Charlemagne had inserted the words 'proceeds from the Father *and the Son*' into the Creed in his realm. In 867 Patriarch Photius denounced the Western addition as heretical and summoned a council to condemn it. Rome would agree to continue to use the Nicene Creed without the *Filioque* until the eleventh century. But by 1054 its use in the West had become so commonplace that Cardinal Humbert accused the Greeks of dropping the phrase, thinking that it was a part of the original Creed!

"The excommunications of 1054 were lifted officially and 'consigned to oblivion' by a joint declaration of Pope Paul VI and the Ecumenical Patriarch Athenagoras I on December 7, 1965. Communion has not been reestablished between the two Churches, but a continuing dialogue has been established to discuss issues of faith and practice" (*TEE* 40-41).

Read these words from Pope John Paul II's apology to the Greeks during his 2001 visit to Athens: *"To God alone belongs judgment, and therefore we entrust the heavy burden of the past to His endless mercy, imploring Him to heal the wounds which still cause suffering to the spirit of the Greek people."*

Ask the following:

- Why would events of 800 years ago still "cause suffering" to the spirit of the Greeks?
- **Explain** that the empire never fully recovered from the losses of the Fourth Crusade and they could not withstand the coming invasion of the Turks who still occupy Constantinople today.

Invasion from the East Page 109

They stole many important holy items and riches and divided the treasures of the capital among themselves. The Westerners drove out the local leaders who had survived the attack and installed their own man as emperor and patriarch. The Byzantine leaders fled to Nicaea where they remained until they recaptured Constantinople in 1261.

When Pope Innocent III learned what happened, he wrote angrily to his representative on the Council. "Whoever suggested such a thing to you and how did they ever lead your mind astray? ... I am, indeed, to the Greek Church to be brought back into ecclesiastical union and to a devotion for this apostolic See when she has been beset with so many afflictions and persecutions that she sees in Latins only an example of perfidy and the works of darkness, so that she now, and with reason, detests the Latins more than dogs!"

The Fourth Crusade was the darkest period in Christian history. The conduct of the Crusaders would drive a lasting wedge between the Greek and Latin Churches, one that is remembered with bitterness to this day.

Invasions from the East

Around the same time, Europe faced an even greater threat. The pagan **Mongols** and Turks under Genghis Khan (1162–1227) had conquered northern China and western Asia at the beginning of the thirteenth century. Assembling all his forces he spread them out, ordering them to "go out and conquer the world."

The Mongols, who soon overran Armenia, Georgia, and northern Iran, adopted Islam as they moved westward. One group of Mongols, called **Tatars**, conquered much of Korea, Russia, and in 1240 captured Kiev. For years that would be a vassal state paying tribute to the Tatar Khan. In 1480 the Tatars were finally defeated by the prince of Moscow. In the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries their territory would be absorbed into the Ottoman Empire and the newly emerging Russian Empire.

Some Mongols had also attacked Seljuk territory in what is now eastern Turkey. They were defeated by the Ottoman sultan of Bursa who, in 1307, was awarded the old Roman province of Bithynia for their efforts. This would be the foundation of the **Ottoman Empire**. Over the next 150 years the Ottoman Turks took more and more territory from the Romans. Finally, in 1453, they attacked Constantinople itself. The last emperor, Constantine XI, was killed in battle and the Ottoman Turks made the city the capital of their own empire. They seized the Great Church of Hagia Sophia (today, the Ayasofya), the largest church in the world, and turned it into a mosque.

The Ottoman Empire would come to rule much of eastern Europe as well as the Middle East in the next hundred years. During the seventeenth century its Balkan territories won their independence. After World War I much of its territory in the Middle East was taken away. The remainder is the modern nation of Turkey.



109

Read this section; then refer to the map on page 178 ("The Mongol Invasions") to show the areas from which the Ottomans, Tatars and other Mongols originated. Point out that then, like today, the population of Asia outnumbered that of Europe. **Ask:**

- What stopped the invaders from driving into Western Europe? **Read and discuss the sidebar** on the Vladimir Mother of God for one answer.

Many people thought that all these tragedies meant that the world would end soon, but this was not the case. God was working to lead Eastern Christians to keep their faith despite persecution for their religion and the destruction of their political freedom. He was teaching people not to trust in God only when things go well but to be faithful to Him no matter what circumstances life brings.

View one of the following titles from the Social Studies School Service:

The Crusades: October 2, 1187 (Social Studies School Service, 30 minutes) -Jerusalem has fallen to Muslim forces. Correspondents Louis de Jaen and Selim Karasi describe the battle, show footage of the carnage, and interview Salah Ed-Din and Count Balian of Ibellin, Crusade commander, to learn the terms of surrender. Will Salah Ed-Din continue his *Jihad* (Holy War) to push the Christians into the sea? Viewers see "archive footage" from 1095 and 1099 to learn about events leading up to the fall of the sacred city.

5. Activity A (Timeline Video Series

The Fall of Byzantium: May 29, 1453 (Social Studies School Service, 30 minutes) - Constantinople, seat of the Roman Empire of Byzantium, falls to the Turks. For more than 1000 years, this glittering capital withstood invasion, helping to keep Western civilization alive during the Dark Ages. As the dust settles after the battle, Urban of Pest, the Hungarian designer of the cannon, is interviewed. Urban's invention has brought victory to the Ottoman sultan and makes "fortified castles and walls out of date."

6. Activity B (The Kingdom Tree)

Remind the students of Jesus' Parable of the Mustard Seed (Matthew 13:31-32; Mark 4:30-32) and the project of the Kingdom Tree. Have the students add a branch representing the events of 1054, 1204 and 1453.

7. Time Line

Refer to the time line poster. Have the students brainstorm the names of people mentioned in this lesson (*The Pope of Rome and Patriarch of Constantinople in 1054 and 1965, the Crusaders, the Mongols, the Ottoman Turks*) and indicate the period in which each lived. Write in the names and dates under each appropriate heading to show the period of these events.

8. Summary

End the lesson by summarizing the lesson from the aims on page 301, from the elements in the student text on which you focused and/or from any other points raised in the lesson.

9. Closing Prayer

Conclude with the reading of the hymn in honor of the Theotokos on page 111 in the student text.

The Kingdom Tree

Add a branch marked The Church Suffers, representing the events of 1054, 1204 and 1453.

